

**EGI-Engage**

Deliverable Review Form

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Details of the document being reviewed** | | | |
| *Title:* | **D4.1 CANFAR Integration Roadmap** | *Document identifier:* | **EGI-doc-2549** |
| *Project:* | **EGI-Engage** | *Document url:* | <https://documents.egi.eu/document/2549> |
| *Author(s):* | **Giuliano Taffoni** | *Date:* |  |

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Identification of the reviewer** | | | |
| *Reviewer:* | **Patrick Mann** | *Activity:* | **[please fill in]** |

**General comments on the content**

|  |
| --- |
| **Comments from Reviewer:** |
| Looks good. Lots of detailed comments in the document. This is essentially a high-level overview with each major component requiring it’s own detailed analysis and review activity as part of the project. As such the breakdown seems fine to me. There are no project plan details so the schedule looks like a reasonable high-level “guesstimate”. This could change considerably as planning for each component proceeds. There are no resourcing estimates (how many staff involved?) but I suspect that it is too early to have those kinds of details included in the project proposal. |
| **Response from Author:** |
| Thanks for the useful comments and corrections. I improve the document according to your suggestions, in particular I better detailed the tests for GMS and VOSpace.  The Roadmap will be updated during the project lifetime following the implementation activity of the different components, and we will prioritize the implementation activities taking in to account also the resources actually available for the project.  Our federation activity will analyze CANFAR architecture but we will also consider the other Open-source solutions proposed by EGI and other projects.  Considering the CANFAR and Compute Canada collaboration activities, I agree that it will be important to strengthen the collaboration with Compute Canada. |

**Additional comments**

*(not affecting the document content e.g. recommendations for the future)*

|  |
| --- |
| **From reviewer:** |
| The CANFAR architecture is all-inclusive. It would be worthwhile considering other open-source projects that might provide some of the component architecture required. For instance Globus might provide the data transfer services, and LDAP (and related services) are customized for user/group management. Currently CANFAR and Compute Canada are considering a project to transition the CANFAR platform to proposed new services to be provided by Compute Canada under a major Cyberinfrastructure funding program. There may be some opportunity for collaboration. |

**Detailed comments on the content**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **N°** | **Page** | **§** | **Observations** | **Reply from author (correction / reject,  …)** |
|  |  |  | **All comments inline in the document** |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |

**English and other corrections:**

Note: English and typo corrections can be made directly in the document as comments.